

## Bhikkhunīs : Buddhist Heroines Crucified and Resurrected (A04)

**A04 "The Document on Resolution about *Bhikkhunī(s)* Which Explains Whether *Bhikkhunī(s)* Should Be or Should Not Be [included] In The Buddha's Dispensation of *Theravāda* In Present Era."**

PDF page	Burmese original	English translation by monk Saraṇa
22	<p style="text-align: center;">၆ ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိဗ္ဗာယစာတမ်း</p> <p>သည်၊ မြတ်စွာဘုရားကို ကြီးပွားစေသူ၊ နို့ချိုတိုက်ကျွေးမွေးမြူခဲ့သူလည်း ဖြစ်ပါသည်။</p> <p>မြတ်စွာဘုရား၏ မယ်တော်ရင်း နတ်ရွာစံသည့်အခါ နို့ချိုတိုက်ကျွေးခဲ့ရပါသည်။</p> <p>ရှင်တော်မြတ်ဘုရား ဘုရားတပည့်တော် တောင်းပန်ပါသည်။ မိထွေးတော်ကြီးကို ငဲ့ညှာသော အားဖြင့် မာတုဂါမများ ဘုရားရှင်သာသနာတော်၌ ရဟန်းမ ပြုရန် ခွင့်ပေးတော်မူပါဘုရား“ဟု လျှောက်ထားလေသည်။</p> <p>ထိုအခါ ဘုရားရှင်က “အာနန္ဒာ---မဟာပဇာပတိဂေါတမီသည် ဂရုဓမ် (အလေးပြုထိုက်သော တရား) ရှစ်ပါးကို အကယ်၍ ဝန်ခံနိုင်လျှင်</p> <p>ထိုဂရုဓမ်ကို ဝန်ခံခြင်းသည်ပင် မဟာပဇာပတိဂေါတမီအတွက် မြင့်မြတ်သော ပဉ္စင်းခံခြင်းဖြစ်စေ (ရဟန်းမ ဖြစ်စေ)”ဟု ခွင့်ပြုတော်မူပြီးလျှင် ဂရုဓမ်ရှစ်ပါးကို ဟောကြားတော်မူလေသည်။</p> <p><b>ဂရုဓမ် (၈)ပါး</b></p> <p>၁။ ဝါတစ်ရာရပြီးသော ဘိက္ခုနီသည် ထိုနေ့ ပဉ္စင်းဖြစ်သော ရဟန်းအား ရှိခိုးခြင်း၊ ခရီးဦးကြိုဆိုခြင်း၊ လက်အုပ်ချီခြင်း၊ အရိုအသေပြုခြင်းအမှုကို ပြုရမည်။</p> <p>ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးမှုဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။</p> <p>၂။ ဘိက္ခုနီသည် ရဟန်းယောက်ျားမရှိသော ကျောင်း၌ ဝါဆိုမနေအပ်။</p> <p>ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးမှုဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။</p> <p>၃။ ဘိက္ခုနီသည် လခွဲတိုင်း ဘိက္ခုသံဃာမှ ဥပုသ်ကို မေးမြန်းခြင်း၊ အဆုံးအမခံရန် ချဉ်းကပ်ခြင်း ဤတရားနှစ်ပါးကို တောင့်တရမည်။</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">6 The Document on Resolution about Bhikkhunīs</p> <p>(She) is the person who brought up the Nobly Lord, the person who breast-fed sweet milk (to the Nobly Lord).</p> <p>When the Nobly Lord's blood-related (/consanguineous) royal mother passed away to the divine village<sup>1</sup>, (Gotamī) had to breast-feed (you, Lord,) with sweet milk.</p> <p>Great noble Lord Buddha, Lord, I plead (you), gracefully permit the ordination of women as bhikkhunī(s) in the Lord Buddha's great Dispensation sympathising with (/mercifully) to (your) great royal step-mother, Lord.”</p> <p>Then, <b>when</b> the Lord Buddha <b>gracefully made (the) permission, saying:</b> “Ānanda, if Mahāpajāpati Gotamī can really accept the Eight <i>Garudhammās</i> [matters worth being taken seriously],”<sup>2</sup></p> <p>(than) that very acceptance of the <i>garudhammās</i> is (“either”) the noble high ordination [or becoming a bhikkhunī] for Mahā Pajāpati Gotamī,”</p> <p><b>The Eight <i>Garudhammās</i></b></p> <p>1. The bhikkhunī who has a hundred rains (/years of monastic seniority) shall perform the worship, respectful welcoming,<sup>3</sup> raising clasped hands, (and) reverence.</p> <p>This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her<sup>4</sup>) life.</p> <p>2. Bhikkhunī shall not spend (her) rains-retreat in a monastery where is no monk.</p> <p>This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.</p> <p>3. Every half of a month bhikkhunī shall approach (monks) for inquiring about the observance (/ <i>uposatha</i>) and receiving admonishment. These two matters should be requested (by her).</p>
23	<p style="text-align: center;">ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိဗ္ဗာယစာတမ်း ၇</p> <p>ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးမှုဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။</p> <p>၄။ ဘိက္ခုနီသည် ဝါကျွတ်ပြီးလတ်သော် ဘိက္ခု၊ ဘိက္ခုနီ နှစ်ဖက်သော သံဃာ၌ မြင်ခြင်း၊ ကြားခြင်း၊ ယုံမှားခြင်းဟူသော သုံးဌာနတို့ဖြင့် ပါရိကာပြုရမည်။</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">The Document on Resolution about Bhikkhunīs 7</p> <p>This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.</p> <p>4. When (she) has finished the rains-retreat, bhikkhunī shall make invitation to the dual Saṅgha (of) bhikkhus and bhikkhunīs (to point out her misdeeds known) by the three ways, namely seeing, hearing, (and) suspicion.</p>

<sup>1</sup> This is the way how Burmese people respectfully express somebody's death, thinking that he/she was born in heaven. The mother of Siddhattha Gotama is believed to be in the Tusita Heaven now, the fourth heaven of six counted from the human realm. (There are twenty realms above these, but their character is different.)

<sup>2</sup> *Garudhamma*, *garu* = serious, heavy; *dhamma* = thing, matter, issue. PTS Dictionary says “rule to be observed,” which certainly is not a literal translation. Perhaps “serious rules” or at least “important points” is more exact.

<sup>3</sup> The Pāli word *paccuṭṭhāna* (*pati* = opposite, forthcoming; *uṭṭhāna* – standing up) is in Burmese translated as “coming forth and welcoming (one coming from) travel.” PTS Dictionary however tries to maintain the literal meaning: “rising from one's seat”.

<sup>4</sup> Although grammatically here should come singular, the intention is to include all bhikkhunīs, i.e. in plural.

	ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးပူဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။	This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.
၅။	ဘိက္ခုနီသည် သံယာဇီသေသ်အာပတ်ကို လွန်ကျူးသင့်ရောက်ခဲ့သော် နှစ်ဖက်သောသံယာဉ် ပက္ခမာနတ်ကျင့်သုံးရမည်။	5. When bhikkhunī has transgressed ("came to transgress") an offense of <i>saṅghādisesa</i> , (she) shall observe the <i>mānatta</i> for a half of a month at both of the Saṅghas. <sup>5</sup>
	ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးပူဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။	This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.
၆။	နှစ်နှစ်ပတ်လုံး ခြောက်ပါးသောတရားတို့၌ ကျင့်သုံးပြီးသော ဘိက္ခုနီသော ဘိက္ခုမာန်အား နှစ်ဖက်သောသံယာဉ် ပဉ္စင်းခံခြင်းကို ရှာမှီးရမည်။	6. The trained <i>sikkhamānā</i> who trained in the six rules for whole two years shall seek the ordination as bhikkhunī at the dual Saṅgha.
	ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးပူဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။	This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.
၇။	ဘိက္ခုနီသည် ရဟန်းယောက်ျားကို တစ်စုံတစ်ခုသော အကြောင်းပရိယာယ်ဖြင့် မဆဲရေး၊ မရေရွတ်ရ။	7. Bhikkhunī must not abuse or defame a monk for whatever reason.
	ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးပူဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။	This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life.
၈။	ဤနေ့ ဤအခါမှစ၍ ရဟန်းတို့အပေါ်၌ ရဟန်းမတို့၏ ပြောဆိုခွင့်ကို ပိတ်ပင်တားမြစ်အပ်၏။	8. From this day, from now on, the permission to judge ("speak") monks by bhikkhunīs is closed and prohibited.
	ရဟန်းမတို့အပေါ်၌ ရဟန်းတို့၏ ပြောဆိုခွင့်ကို မပိတ်ပင်အပ်။	The permission to judge ("speak") bhikkhunīs by monks is not closed (/prohibited).
	ဤတရားကိုလည်း ရိုသေလေးစား မြတ်နိုးပူဇော်၍ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်။	This matter should be also respected, venerated, cherished, and worshiped, without transgressing (it) throughout (her) life. <sup>6</sup>
24	၈ ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိဗ္ဗာနတရား	8 The Document on Resolution about Bhikkhunīs
	အာနန္ဒာ--- မဟာပဇာပတိဂေါတမီသည် ဤဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို အကယ်၍ ဝန်ခံနိုင်ငြားအံ့၊ ထိုဝန်ခံခြင်းသည်ပင်	Ānanda, if Mahāpajāpati Gotamī can really accept the eight <i>garudhammās</i> , (than) that very acceptance of the <i>garudhammās</i> is ("either") the noble high

<sup>5</sup> *Saṅghādisesa* is a class of offences included in the *patimokkha*, the list of main rules, for both *bhikkhus* and *bhikkhunīs*.

<sup>6</sup> Ven. Anālayo analyzes the eight *garudhammās* in his document "The Legality of Bhikkhunī Ordination", which appeared in "Journal of Buddhist Ethics", vol. 20, 2013. His analysis may be summarized in a few points:

A. Although the fourth *garudhamma* implies that "garudhamma" is *saṅghādisesa*, in this context it means a "grave offence", namely *saṅghādisesa*, and not transgressing one of these eight *garudhammās* declared before the *bhikkhunī* dispensation was established. Four of the *garudhammās* are mentioned as *pācittiyas* in the *bhikkhunīvibhaṅga*: 2 = *pācittiya* no. 56, 3 = *pācittiya* no. 59, 4 = *pācittiya* no. 57, and 7 = *pācittiya* no. 52. – and all of these claim that the first doer (*ādikammika*) committed no offence, meaning that *garudhammās* didn't constitute an offence, hence these *pācittiyas* had to be introduced when the relevant issue was encountered. Therefore, the eight *garudhammās* are not Vinaya rules *per se*, they are "principles to be respected". Note however, that if one transgresses a rule out of disrespecting the Buddha's prohibition, when there was no offence mentioned for the transgression, he/she will incur *dukkatā* offence. (So far I do not have the reference to this Commentarial statement.)

B. The fact that the ordination in Bodhgaya in 1998 did not involve *sikkhamānā* ordination doesn't mean that anyone would have an offence for that, because out of respect to the eight *garudhammās* the precept nuns trained for "many years" (ven. P.M. Moorthree in his "A Critical Study of the Re-Establishment of Bhikkhunī-Sangha in Sri Lanka", 2548 BE (2004 CE), p.43 (PDF p.52) however says "DSMs [i.e. ten precept nuns] should be trained for six or seven years," as a suggestion by ven. Prof. D. Medānanda. However, nowhere in the text is written how many years did the Sinhalese precept nuns ordained in India in fact trained. Rather, on p.50 (PDF p.59) I read: "Bhikkhunīs students receive three months training for higher ordination. ... Those who passed the final examination were qualified to receive Bhikkhunī higher Ordination.")

C. A bhikkhunī who gives higher ordination to a female candidate who didn't train as *sikkhamānā* for the two years, will have *pācittiya* offence (*pācittiya* no. 63). However, because the bhikkhunī ordination was *dhammakamma*, i.e. officially done, the female candidate becomes a bhikkhunī anyway – *dhammakamme adhammakammasaṅgīṇī vuṭṭhāpeti*.

D. The eight *garudhammās* were declared for women and bhikkhunīs, not for monks. Therefore monks are not obliged to follow them. (This point will be explained and analyzed below, in the translated text. In short, the Burmese version of *Aṭṭhakathā* indicates that the eight *garudhammās* were a decisive declaration of the Buddha for monks, whereas the Burmese version of *Ṭīkā* as well as the Sinhalese version of *Aṭṭhakathā* do not seem to indicate that.)

I would like to add two more points:

E. Although Mahā Pajāpati Gotamī so gladly accepted the eight *garudhammās*, she herself was ordained neither by bhikkhus nor by bhikkhunīs. Even so, the Buddha ascertained that she was bhikkhunī indeed. (I.e. then what was exactly meant by "accepting" the eight *garudhammās* and "not transgressing them throughout life"? Certainly, not unconditional observance.)

F. Although the five hundred Sakyan princesses were bound by the eight *garudhammās*, none of them took two years *sikkhamānā* training from a bhikkhunī *saṅgha* or got the higher ordination from *saṅgha* of bhikkhunīs. There was no criticism of the five hundred Sakyan princesses for that. (I.e. then what was exactly meant by "accepting" the eight *garudhammās* and "not transgressing them throughout life"? Certainly, not unconditional observance.)

	မဟာပဏ္ဍိတဂေါတမီအတွက် ပဉ္စင်ခံခြင်း ဖြစ်စေ (ရဟန်းမ ဖြစ်စေ) ဟု မိန့်တော်မူလေသည်။	ordination [or becoming a bhikkhunī] for Mahā Pajāpati Gotamī,” gracefully declared (the Buddha).
	ထိုအခါအရှင်အာနန္ဒာသည် မြတ်စွာဘုရားအထံတော်မှ ဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို သင်ယူပြီးလျှင် မိတ္ထေတော်ဂေါတမီအထံသို့ သွားရောက်၍	Then, when ven. Ānanda learned the eight <i>garudhammās</i> at the Nobly Lord, (he) went (“(and) arrived”) near the royal step-mother Gotamī,
	“ဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို အကယ်၍ သင်ဝန်ခံခြင်းအံ့၊ ထိုဝန်ခံ ခြင်းသည်ပင် သင့်အတွက် ပဉ္စင်ခံခြင်း ဖြစ်စေ (ရဟန်းမ ဖြစ်စေ)ဟု ပြန်ကြား၍ ဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို ဟောကြားလေသည်။”	And after (he) related (to her): “If you really accept the eight <i>garudhammās</i> , (than) that very acceptance of the <i>garudhammās</i> is (“either”) the noble high ordination [or becoming a bhikkhunī] for you,” (ven. Ānanda) preached (to her) the eight <i>garudhammās</i> .”
	<b>မိတ္ထေတော်ဂေါတမီ မြင့်မြတ်သောရဟန်းမ အဖြစ်သို့ရောက်ခြင်း</b>	The Royal Step-Mother Gotamī’s Coming to the Noble State of Bhikkhunī
	ထိုအခါ မိတ္ထေတော်ဂေါတမီသည် လွန်စွာဝမ်းမြောက်လျက် “အရှင်ဘုရား အာနန္ဒာ---ဥပမာအားဖြင့် တန်ဆာဆင်ခြင်းသဘော ရှိသော ရေချိုး ခေါင်းလျော်ပြီးသောမိန်းမပျို၊ ယောက်ျားပျိုသည် ကြာပန်း၊ မိုးစွေပန်း (မြတ်လေးစပယ်ပန်း) စစ်ကြီးပန်းများကို ရခဲလျှင် လက်နှစ်ဖက်ဖြင့်ခံယူကာ ဦးခေါင်း၌ ပန်ဆင်သကဲ့သို့	Then the royal step-mother Gotamī, extremely happy, <b>respectfully said</b> : “Venerable sir Ānanda, for example, like if a virgin girl or virgin lad bathed and with head washed received the (such as) lotus, “star ipomea – jasmine flower” ( <i>vassikamāla</i> ) (and) “great-battle flower” ( <i>atimuttakamāla/adhimattaka</i> (Thai)), <sup>7</sup> (they would) adorn (them) on (their) heads by both of (their) heands,
	ဤအတူပင် တပည့်တော်မသည်လည်း ဤဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို ခံယူပါ၏။ အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးပါ ဘုရား” ဟု လျှောက်ထားလေသည်။	In the same way, I also accept these eight <i>garudhammās</i> and throughout (my) life (I) won’t transgress (them), lord.” <sup>8</sup>
	ထိုသို့ မိတ္ထေတော်ဂေါတမီက ဝန်ခံလိုက်သောအခါ အရှင်အာနန္ဒာသည် ဘုရားရှင်ထံမှောက်သို့ သွားရောက်ဦးချ၍	Then, when the royal step-mother accepted (the eight <i>garudhammās</i> ), ven. Ānanda approached the lord Buddha, bent (his) head (in respect), and
	“ရှင်တော်မြတ်ဘုရား မဟာပဏ္ဍိတဂေါတမီသည် ဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးကို ဝန်ခံလိုက်ပါပြီ။	<b>respectfully said</b> : “Great noble Lord Buddha, Mahā Pajāpati Gotamī has accepted the eight <i>garudhammās</i> ,
	မြတ်စွာဘုရား၏ မိတ္ထေတော်သည် မြင့်မြတ်သော ရဟန်းမ အဖြစ်သို့ ရောက်ပါပြီ ဘုရား”ဟု လျှောက်ထားလေသည်။	(and thus) the Nobly Lord’s royal step-mother has come to the noble state of bhikkhunī, Lord.”
25	ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိစ္ဆယစာတမ်း ၉	The Document on Resolution about Bhikkhunīs 9
	<b>မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခြင်းကြောင့် သာသနာတော် တည်ခြင်း မတည်ခြင်း</b>	<b>Duration/Non-Duration of the Great Dispensation Due to Ordaining (“Making”) Bhikkhunīs (from) Women</b>
	ထိုအခါ ဘုရားရှင်က “မာတုဂါမများ ဘုရားရှင် သာသနာတော်၌ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့်ကို အကယ်၍ မရခဲလျှင် မြတ်သောအကျင့်တည်းဟူသော သာသနာတော်သည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ တည်ခွဲလေရာ၏။	Then the Lord Buddha <b>gracefully declared</b> : “If women in fact didn’t obtain the permission to be ordained as bhikkhunīs in the great Dispensation of the Lord Buddha, the great Dispensation called “Noble Training” would have stayed for long,
	သူတော်ကောင်းတရားတည်းဟူသော သာသနာတော်သည် နှစ်တစ်ထောင် တည်ခွဲလေရာ၏။	(and) the great Dispensation called “True Dhamma” would have stayed for thousand years.” <sup>9</sup>

<sup>7</sup> These flowers are translated as “a garland of lotus flowers or a garland of jasmine flowers or a garland of some sweet-scented creeper” by I.B. Horner in the Book of Discipline, vol.5 p.355 .

<sup>8</sup> The joyful acceptance of these rules, so difficult to be followed, is indeed remarkable. I will discuss the purpose of these rules later, below. What is however often-times questioned, is the reason why would the Buddha refuse to establish the bhikkhunī order and then He would accept it? The authors of the Commentaries were aware of this question, and theirs is this explanation in *Cūlavagga Aṭṭhakathā – 10. Bhikkhunikkhandhakam - Mahāpajāpatigotamīvathukathā* : “*alam gotamī mā te rucṭi kasmā paṭikkhipati, nanu sabbesampi buddhānaṃ catasso parisā honti? Kāmaṃ honti, kilametvā pana anekakkhattuṃ yācītena anuññātaṃ pabbajjāṃ “dukkhena laddhā ayaṃ amhehi”ti sammā paripālessanti bhaddakam katvā anujānītukāmo paṭikkhipati*” = “Gotami, (that is) not suitable, may (you) not wish” – why does (the Buddha) refuse? Aren’t there the Four Assemblies indeed at every Buddha? Indeed, there are. However, becoming tired and pleading for many times, (the women) will well follow the declared going forth (thinking) “through suffering it was attained by us”, and doing the right thing, (the Buddha) refused, desirous of accepting (later).” So the Buddha, it seems, was very well aware that the eight *garudhammās* are extremely difficult to be accepted, and therefore He waited for the situation when the women were so extremely done for, that they would simply give in, whatever the conditions would be.

<sup>9</sup> This is the interpretation of the *brahmācariya* (*brahma* = noble, *cariya* = livelihood), and *saddhamma* (interpreted in Burmese as “the truth of the great good person”). This points to the possibility that the practice (*paṭipatti*) would last long, and the theory/teachings (*pariyatti*) would last a thousand years. If this understanding is correct, then it would speak contrary to the commentaries which argue that the theory (*pariyatti*) will exist longer than the practice (*paṭipatti*). The commentaries however explain that *saddhamma* is of three kinds, namely the theory, the practice, and the attainment:

*Saddhammatṭhitiyā paṭipanno hotīti ettha pana tividho saddhammo pariyattipaṭipattiadhiḡamavasena. Tattha teṇṇakam buddhavacanāṃ pariyattisaddhammo nāma. Terasa dhutaṇṇagunā cūddasa khandhakavattāni dveasīti mahāvattānīti ayaṃ paṭipattisaddhammo nāma. Cattāro maggā ca phalāni cāti ayaṃ adhiḡamasaddhammo nāma.* = “Practicing the True Dhamma,” (that) there however means three-fold True Dhamma, namely the learning, the practice, and the attainment. There the three *piṭakas*, the word of the Buddha, that is the True Dhamma of learning. The thirteen ascetic practices (*dhutaṇṇa*), fourteen *khandhaka* duties, and the eighty-two great duties, that is the True Dhamma of practice. The four Paths as well as the Fruitions, that is called the True Dhamma of attainment.” (*Pācittiya Aṭṭhakathā 5.8.2. par. 438*)

The allegedly Buddha’s verses together with the detailed explanation of why the learning (*pariyatti*) is the carrier and protector of the Dispensation – rather than the practice of morality and meditation (*paṭipatti*) - appear in *ANA 1.10. par. 130, Sāratthadīpanī Tīkā-3 5.8.2. par. 438, Vimativinodanī-Tīkā 5.8.2. par. 438* and in ven. Kassapa’s *Mohavicchedanī - 2. Vibhaṇṇamātikā - Nāṇavibhaṇṇamātikathavaṇṇanā*. The Buddha’s

	အာနန္ဒာ---မာတုဂါမများ ဘုရားရှင်သာသနာတော်၌ ရဟန်းမပြုခွင့်ရရာ ဤအခါ၌ မြတ်သောအကျင့် တည်းဟူသော သာသနာတော်သည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ တည်တော့မည်မဟုတ်၊	Ānanda, if the women didn't get permission to be ordained as bhikkhunīs, the great Dispensation called "Noble Training" is not going to stay for long,
	သူတော်ကောင်းတရားတည်းဟူသော သာသနာတော်သည် နှစ်ငါးရာသာ တည်နိုင်တော့လတ္တံ့။	(and) the great Dispensation called "True Dhamma" is going to stay only five hundred years.
	အာနန္ဒာ---ဥပမာပြရလျှင် မိန်းမသာများ၍ ယောက်ျားနည်းသော အမျိုး(အိမ်)တို့ကို အိုးမီးရောင်ဖြင့် ခိုးတတ်သော အညံ့စား ခိုးသူတို့သည်ပင် လွယ်ကူစွာ ဖျက်ဆီးနိုင်သကဲ့သို့၊	Ānanda, showing an example, like when the poor robbers easily rob by the light in a pot (/lighting a lamp in a pot and using it instead of a torch) the houses where women are many and men are little,
	ဤအတူပင် မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့်ရရာ သာသနာတော်သည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ တည်နိုင်လိမ့်မည် မဟုတ်ချေ။	In the same way, when women get permission to be ordained as bhikkhunīs, the great Dispensation indeed cannot stay for long.
	အာနန္ဒာ---ဥပမာနောက်တစ်မျိုးကား ကောင်းမွန်ပြည့်စုံသော လယ်၌ ဖလဖြူရောဂါမျိုး ကျရောက်ခဲ့ခြင်းအံ့၊ ထိုလယ်ခင်းသည် ကြာမြင့် စွာမတည်နိုင်သကဲ့သို့၊	Ānanda, as for another example, suppose that the (plant) disease of blight <sup>10</sup> would fall upon a good, complete rice field. Like that field (which) will not be able to stay long,
	ဤအတူပင် မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့်ရရာ သာသနာတော်သည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ တည်နိုင်တော့မည် မဟုတ်ချေ။	In the same way, wen women get permission to be ordained as bhikkhunīs, the great Dispensation indeed cannot stay for long.
	အာနန္ဒာ---ဥပမာနောက်တစ်မျိုးကား- ကောင်းမွန်ပြည့်စုံသော ကြံခင်း၌ အူနီရောဂါမျိုး ကျရောက်ခဲ့ခြင်းအံ့၊ ထိုကြံခင်းသည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ မတည်နိုင်သကဲ့သို့၊	Ānanda, as for another example, suppose the (plant) disease of red rot would fall upon a good, complete sugar-cane field. Like that sugar-cane field (which) will not be able to stay long,
	ဤအတူပင် မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့်ရရာ သာသနာတော်သည် ကြာမြင့်စွာ တည်နိုင်တော့မည် မဟုတ်ချေ။	In the same way, wen women get permission to be ordained as bhikkhunīs, the great Dispensation indeed cannot stay for long.
26	ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိစ္ဆယစာတမ်း (၁၀) <sup>11</sup>	10 The Document on Resolution about Bhikkhunīs
	အာနန္ဒာ---ဥပမာပြရလျှင် ယောက်ျားသည် ကြီးစွာသော တစ်ဖက်ဆည်ကန်၏ ကန်ပေါင် ကန်ရိုးကို ရေမကျော်နိုင်အောင် စောစောကြိုတင်၍ ဖွဲ့ထားရာသကဲ့သို့၊	Ānanda, showing an example, like when a man makes a huge dyke well in advance on one side - a bank of a dam so that the water cannot exceed (over a limit),
	ဤအတူပင် ငါဘုရားသည် စောစော ကြိုတင်၍ ရဟန်းမများအတွက် ဂရုဓမ္မရှစ်ပါးတို့ကို ပညတ်တားအပ်ကုန်ပြီ၊	In the same way I, the Lord, has well in advance declared the eight <i>garudhammās</i> for the bhikkhunīs.
	အသက်ထက်ဆုံး မလွန်ကျူးအပ်ကုန်ဟု မိန့်တော်မူလေသည်။ (စူဠဝဂ္ဂပါဠိ ၄၄၂-မှ-၄၄၇)	(They) must not be transgressed throughout the life (of a bhikkhunī).” ( <i>Cūlavaggapāli</i> – 10. <i>Bhikkhunikkhandhaka</i> - <i>Atthagarudhammā</i> , PTS 2.255 .)
	ဘုရားရှင်စကားတော်၏ ဆိုလိုရင်းအဓိပ္ပါယ်ကား- ရေကန်ကြီးတစ်ကန်၌ ကန်ပေါင် ကန်ရိုးဖွဲ့မထားလျှင် ရေများလျှံထွက်သွားသောကြောင့် ရေအနည်းငယ်သာတည်ရာ၏။	As for the meaning of the Lord Buddha's great words: if a dyke at a bank is not made at a large lake, (then) after a lot of water spills away, there will be just a little water remaining (/“staying”).
	ကန်ပေါင် ကန်ရိုးဖွဲ့ထားလျှင်ကား ထိုလျှံထွက်သွားမည့်ရေများ မထွက်တော့ဘဲ တည်ထိုက်သော ရေအားလုံး တည်ဖွယ်ရှိသကဲ့သို့၊	However, if a dyke is made at a bank, (then) the waters that will spill (away) won't (be able to) exceed, keeping (/“staying”) all of the water that should stay and be (there),
	ဤအတူပင် မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုလာသည့်အတွက် နဂိုက တည်ဖွယ်ရှိသော နှစ်တစ်ထောင်မှ ထက်ဝက်လျော့၍ ငါးရာသာ တည်တော့ရာ၏။	In the same way, because of the ordaining of women as bhikkhunīs, the original one thousand years of staying (of the Dispensation) decreased to half, (and therefore the Dispensation) will stay only five hundred (years).
	သို့သော် ဂရုဓမ္မကို ကြိုတင်ပညတ်တားလိုက်သည့်အတွက် ငါးရာမလျော့တော့ဘဲ ယခု မိန့်တော်မူသည့် အတိုင်း နှစ်တစ်ထောင်ပင် တည်လိမ့်မည်ဟုလိမ့်။ (စူဠဝဂ္ဂ အဋ္ဌကထာ-၁၂၇)	However, because the <i>garudhammās</i> were declared in advance, (the Dispensation), being not decreased to five hundred (years), it shall stay even the thousand years (just) as it was gracefully declared before. <sup>12</sup> ( <i>Cūlavagga</i>

verses mentioned there appear nowhere in the main text of Pāli, and the idea itself is supported by the Buddha only in one place – when He declared that wrong versions of His speech will lead to disappearance of the Dispensation in *AN 1.2. par.20-21* –

*"Dveme, bhikkhave, dhammā saddhammassa sammosāya antaradhānāya saṃvattanti. Katame dve? Dunnikkhitañca padabyañjanaṃ attho ca dunnīto. Dunnikkhittassa, bhikkhave, padabyañjanassa atthopi dunnayo hoti. Ime kho, bhikkhave, dve dhammā saddhammassa sammosāya antaradhānāya saṃvattanti"ti.* = "These two reasons, monks, are the cause of confusion and disappearance of the True Dhamma. Which two? Wrong arrangement of the word meaning, and wrong understanding of the interpretation. Monks, by wrong arrangement of the word meaning the understanding of the interpretation is also wrong. These, monks, are indeed the two reasons which are the cause of confusion and disappearance of the True Dhamma."

The idea that theory (*pariyatti*) is the carrier of the Dispensation can be well understood from the decision of ven. Mahā Kassapa to arrange the First Buddhist Council – to prevent disappearing of the rules and teachings or modifications by frivolous persons. In fact, this very attitude to the preservation of the original genuine theory/learning (*pariyatti*) of Theravāda is particularly important when considering a Pāli text as "added later".

<sup>10</sup> I.B. Horner translates the original *setatthika* as "mildew".

<sup>11</sup> For unknown reason, the page number is not mentioned in this page.

<sup>12</sup> An interpretation was given to me by ven. Paññāvaṃsa (*Vinayapiṭakadhara, Vinayapiṭakakovidā*), the sayadaw of Shwe Oo Min Tawya in Yangon, Mingalardon : the Buddha declared the eight *garudhammās* to prevent non-Buddhists and doubters from accusing the Buddha of following a wish of a crying woman. This, however, is not an interpretation of the Commentaries.



Now at this stage it will be necessary to show how do the Pāli scriptures deal with “woman” in reference to monks. A whole tome could be composed on this topic, so I will just mention a few important points. (This footnote continues on the next page.)

From *AN 1.1. par.1-10* we learn that for man the most pleasurable source of sensual experience in the world is woman, and right after that, without any distinction whatsoever, we learn that for women the most pleasurable source of sensual experience in the world is man. Although this is shown as subjective experience, I think it should be pointed out before we start to discuss whether it is woman or man who is the perpetrator, the culprit, guilty of arousing lust in the other gender..

There are various occurrences in the Pāli scriptures of female as the attractor, including the quotes of the Buddha Himself. Critics might suggest that male’s seduction techniques are rare in the scriptures, simply because they were compiled by males only. That, however, would be a prejudiced conclusion. Ven. Udāyi, the deterrent example for Don Juans in robes, plays chief roles in a number of *Saṅghādisesas*, *Nissaggiya-Pācittiyas*, and *Pācittiyas*, where his seduction techniques and tricks are exposed and even proverbial among monks today. All these cases led one way or another to declaration of a Vinaya rule, and those rules have been recited fortnightly throughout millenia. The cases of “the group of six monks” are mentioned in *Cūlavagga 10.2.* The commentarial stories, however, do not contain many cases of men seducing women.

In Myanmar perhaps the most famous sutta on “danger of female” is *Mātaputta Sutta* in *AN 5.1(6).5.* which narrates the case of a mother with her son, who became bhikkhunī and a monk, and through close contact they gradually became intimate and had a sexual intercourse. I’ve heard so far only three stories of mother and son in intimate relationship, and in all of them mother plays the chief role in seducing. But of course, these might have been fabrications or irrelevant exceptions to the otherwise. At the end of this *sutta* the Buddha pronounces famous verses, well known among educated Burmese monks -

*'Sallape asihatthena, pisācenāpi sallape; Āsivisampi āsīde [āsadde (syā. kaṃ.)], yena daṭṭho na jīvati. 'Natveva eko ekāya, mātuḡāmena sallape; Mutṭhassatiṃ tā bandhanti, pekkhiteṇa sitena ca [mhitena ca (syā. kaṃ.)]. 'Athopi dunnivatthena, mañjunā bhaniteṇa ca; Neso jano svāsisado, api ugghātito mato.' = “(A monk) might speak with one armed in sword, (a monk) might speak with a demon. (A monk) might sit by a poisonous snake, such that if bites (the monk) won’t stay alive. However, (monk) shall not speak with a woman in private, (lest) they bind the one of blunt mindfulness, by glance and smile; or even by poor clothing, and sweet talk. That (kind) of people is not to be sat with, even (if they are) beheaded and dead.”*

In *Bhikkhunī Sutta, AN 4.1(16).9.* a bhikkhunī has ven. Ānanda called to her chamber, sending him message that she is ill. When she saw him coming from distance, she lied in her bed, covered her face and pretended sickness. Ven. Ānanda realized that she wanted to seduce him, and gave her a profound talk on Dhamma, an instruction to get rid of lust, to become an Arahant. The bhikkhunī realized her folly and pleaded ven. Ānanda for forgiveness.

Commentarial accounts on women as the attractors and seductors are virtually countless. The *jātakas* contain a lot of uncensored stories of lust and sexual plays, heralded by the tabooed *Nilinikā Jātaka (J. 526)*, and then the *Kuṇāla Jātaka (J. 536)*, the extensive treatise on woman’s skills in deception. *Kuṇāla Jātaka* is a very important source of information on the attitude toward women (at least in terms of sexual relationship) in the time when the Pāli Commentaries were written. It contains a list of forty (by number: 40) “tricks” which woman uses to seduce a man, such as bending her body, shaking her hindquarters, exposing a thigh, licking a lip, blinking with eyes, etc. An extreme example of female attracting male, resulting in the male’s being devoured, is the *Talapatta Jātaka (J. 96)* where the *bodhisatta* travels through a wilderness with his five friends, and each of these friends get seduced by a female-ogre disguised as a beautiful woman. In each case the female-ogre attempts to seduce by a different sensual pleasure (sight, sound, smell, taste, contact), and after she wins over a man, she takes him to her lair where she devours him alive. The story doesn’t explicitly say that when a monk disrobes and gets married he is thus “devoured” by the female, but I understand it so.

I would like to hypothesize that like in the animal kingdom, in the human world one of the genders is “attracting” and the other is “attracted”. In other words, one gender has developed the skill to arouse lust in another gender, and that skill is better than the other gender has. A lot of males have developed bodily features to attract female, such as plumage in peacocks, branched mandibles in stag beetle, antlers in deers, etc.. In certain species it is female who seems to be the gender developed to attract, such as praying mantis or black widow. My humble hypothesis is, that in humans it is female who developed to attract. Unlike man, who has no specific feature or skill to attract which the female would not have at least in counterpart, certain scientists claim that female’s breast have gained their proportion solely to attract the male gender - interestingly, females of no species in the animal kingdom have proportionate breast before they become pregnant. Because of this I dare to hypothesize that in humans, female is the gender that attracts, and male is the gender which is attracted. Of course, this is extremely relative fact, and a very dangerous idea as well (!) . I present it here for the reader as an external point for considering the Buddha’s decisions.

So the bottom-line is, that females entering monastic environment might arouse lust in monks by their sheer presence. It would not be easy to make rules such as not to lick lips or speak in high pitched tone to circumscribe the females’ ways.

Regarding the declaration of eight *garudhammās*, all of the eight can be summarized into two – (1) subjugation of bhikkhunīs to monks (*garudhammā 1,3,7,8*) and (2) limitation of freedom for bhikkhunīs (*garudhammā 2,4,5,6*).

(1) The reason that other sects and other religions also keep women subjugated to men is certainly not the only reason, if not the least important. The reason for paying obeisance to monks and being prohibited to point out a monk’s fault is perhaps to prevent arguments – and those experienced in sexual partnership might testify how a heated argument can immediately turn into burning of lust. -> If so, then why is it not monks who would be subjugated to women? If that were so, it would not be possible to carry out the second point (explained below), i.e. preventing the bhikkhunīs from danger and protecting them against defaming. In other words, monks who would be accused of a misdeed, prohibited to reveal that in fact a bhikkhunī was wrong, might not be willing to render protection for that bhikkhunī in dangerous circumstances. In this case, regardless their relationship, the monks are always in a better position. (But in case of a monk’s serious misbehavior, bhikkhunīs are allowed to “punish” that monk by united decision not to speak with him, viz. *Cūlavagga 10.2.*) Thus in every case monks should carry out their responsibilities of protecting and securing the bhikkhunīs. - In short, bhikkhunīs’ protection is the fundamental reason for monks’ supremacy.

(2) Bhikkhunīs do not have unlimited freedom in choice of residence, and they do not have sole authority over the main monastic procedures such as ordination and purification of *saṅghādisesa* offence. The cases of bhikkhunīs raped and robbed just and only because monks were not nearby are vividly described, for example in *Pācittiya Pāli 3.7. Saṃvidhāna Sikkhāpada* and *8. Nāvābhirūhana Sikkhāpada*. The four *garudhammā* rules

		<i>Atthakathā - 10. Bhikkhunikkhandhaka – Mahāpajāpatigotamīvattukathā – par.403, PTS 6.1290 .)</i> <sup>13</sup>
	ဧကတာဥပသမ္ပန္န ရဟန်းမ အဖြစ် ခွင့်ပြုခြင်း	Permission to Become Bhikkhunī by Single (Side) Higher Ordination ( <i>Ekatoupasampanna</i> )
	မိထွေးတော်မဟာပဇာပတိဂေါတမီသည် ဂရုဓမ္မကို ဝန်ခံခြင်းဖြင့် ရဟန်းမ ဖြစ်ပြီးနောက် သာကီဝင်မင်းသမီးငါးရာတို့ ရဟန်းမ အဖြစ် ရရှိရေးသီးခြားမိန့်တော် မမူသေးသောကြောင့်	After the royal step-mother Gotamī became a bhikkhunī by accepting the <i>garudhammās</i> , because (the Buddha) has not yet gracefully decided regarding the bhikkhunī ordination of the five hundred Sakyan princesses,
	ဘုရားရှင်ထံမှောက်	(Gotamī) <b>approached and bowed</b> to the Lord Buddha,

(2,4,5,6) ascertain that bhikkhunīs are always under the patronage and auspices of monks, both to prevent their rape and robbery, and to protect them against those who might try to judge them unjustly or discredit them.

<sup>13</sup> The related Sub-Commentary, *Sāratthadīpanī-Ṭīkā – 10. Bhikkhunikkhandhakaṃ - Atthagarudhammakathāvaṇṇanā – par. 403*, then explains that different elders who memorized different portions of the Pāli scriptures teach the process of disappearance of the “True Dhamma” in slightly different ways. Those who memorized *Dīgha Nikāya* teach that the Arahants with *Paṭisambhidā* attainment will disappear after the first thousand years, then the Arahants with Six Higher Psychic Powers (*chaḷabhiññā*) after the second thousand, then the Arahants with Three Knowledges (i.e. telepathy, remembering past lives, and freedom from all defilements) after the third thousand (so today these should be somewhere.. ), the Arahants without meditation absorptions (*jhāna*) after the fourth thousand, and finally the code of discipline, *pātimokkha*, will last the last thousand years. Other elders say pretty much the same, but they do not state the length of the periods.